

The Impact Study Report on Subratha (ISLs) in Nizamabad, AP¹

1. INTRODUCTION – SUBHRATHA

Subharatha is an ambitious social welfare program aimed at improving the cleanliness of rural environment by encouraging the construction of individual sanitary latrines. Previous sanitation programs of providing community latrines have met with several problems of location and maintenance of units due to lack of individual concern and community belongingness among beneficiaries in realizing the benefits of the scheme. Present scheme intends to drive the message of necessity for sanitary latrines targeting the independent households. The scheme is significantly positioned with financial incentives, supply of construction material locally and supported by strong motivating campaign in the entire district. Success of the scheme was ensured by the responsive District Administration through monitoring of achievement of target for mandal level and management information system emanating from grass root level.

Nisiet has taken up the rapid impact study of Subhratha scheme collaterally with evaluation study of micro credit scheme of AP Backward Classes Finance Development Corporation in Nizamabad District. It is at the request of District Collector nisiet study team took special interest in the beneficiary perception of the implementation of scheme. At the end of the study, **nisiet** study team is greatly impressed by the positive impact of the scheme on the improvement of cleanliness of rural environment and high level of satisfaction displayed by the beneficiaries in owning ISL units.

It is hoped that Nizamabad districts success will set the trend for other district in the state other States as well in taking the scheme to the village with more commitment and perfection. **nisiet** study is another effort in the above direction with documentation of success factors and diagnosis of critical gaps in the scheme which need correction for accelerating the reach of the scheme to the needy beneficiaries all over the country. Though the study is very limited in approach the conclusions and recommendations have wider application in improving the implementation of the scheme.

¹ .The Study was conducted by Nisiet, Hyderabad in October 2002

2. STUDY DESIGN

OBJECTIVES:

The broad objective of the study is to undertake a rapid assessment of the impact generated by the implementation of Subhratha Scheme (ISL) in Nizamabad District. The specific objectives are as follows:

- To identify the critical gaps in the implementation of the scheme that have bearing on the impact of the scheme and to suggest suitable remedial measures.
- To gather and assess the perceptions of the beneficiaries on the benefits accruing out of the scheme and to analyse the grievances of the beneficiaries.

STUDY TECHNIQUES & TOOLS:

- Structured and informal interview with beneficiaries
- Field inspection of sample units financed
- Interaction with officials of the scheme
- Data analysis and diagnostic study
- Structure of report

PRESENTATION :

In order to present a logical and sequential report, the following chapters are designed.

- I. **Introduction** deals with the concept and importance of the scheme
- II. **Implementation of the Scheme** deals with the procedural and guidelines of the scheme and status of implementation.
- III. **Field reflections:** Presents the field investigation observations and views of the field level officers/ also deals with the critical gaps in the implementation of the scheme.
- IV. **Impact of the scheme:** Presents the objective assessment of the opinions of the beneficiaries and field results of the scheme.
- V. **Findings and recommendations:** Summarizes the areas for improvement and recommendations of the study team.

Scope and Limitations of study: The scope of the study is limited to a rapid appraisal of the impact of the scheme.

3. IMPLEMENTATION OF THE SCHEME

REVIEW OF PERFORMANCE

1) Table No.3.1, 3.2 & 3.3 indicates the achievement by various Mandals vis-à-vis the sanctions made under the scheme as on 31.08.2002. Out of the targeted **1,04,717** units **83161** are reported to have been grounded. 30% reservation for SCs and STs is maintained in the sanctions.

- Before initiating the project it is observed that lot of spadework has been done by the district administration, in working out a technical requirement for the execution of the project. The major bottleneck of the shortage of the rings and skilled masons, was tackled with administrative expedience by procuring the masons from out side the district also, where ever necessary. Rings were indented from Nirmiti Kendras wherever possible. In addition Rural Water Supply wing also provided about 70 moulds at the rate of two for each of the mandals. These moulds were also utilized by the beneficiaries free of cost.
- Funding of the scheme – The scheme which falls under the Central Government Sanitation program is funded by the State and Central Governments and in turn supported by the beneficiaries' contribution in terms of labour/margin. The unit worked out is as follows.
 - State government Rs.375.00
 - Central government Rs.375.00
 - Beneficiaries contribution Rs.125.002 quintals of rice towards labour equivalent to Rs.1200/- approximately.
- **PUBLICITY FOR THE SCHEME** : The district administration has utilized the services of MPDOs, MROs and village secretaries in propagating the benefits of the scheme at the grass root level. The services of NGOs and also SHGs have been utilized effectively for the purpose.
- **SELECTION OF BENEFICIARIES** :- The beneficiaries selection is found to be transparent, on the whole, with emphasis on giving priority for the women beneficiaries. Women have been chosen even in cases where the house property is

owned by the spouse. **The large number of women beneficiaries, certainly reflects the social empowerment enjoyed by them under the scheme.**

- **MODELS AND TECHNICAL SUPPORT:** Administration has given the choice to the beneficiaries by providing 3 models. It has also given the discretion to the beneficiaries to opt for additional construction of wall for the purpose of the bathroom. Since there is very little technical input in the construction, the local masons have been able to do the job satisfactorily.
- **MAINTENANCE OF RECORDS AND DISTRIBUTION OF SUBSIDY:** Special management information system maintained at mandal level containing the photographs of the beneficiaries and the progress of the construction. The final payment of subsidy and rice quota was made only after the completion. One uniform relaxation allowed under the scheme is to treat the construction without shelter as completed unit.

4. FIELD REFLECTIONS

CONSTRAINTS AND ISSUES IN IMPLEMENTATION

- In view of the ambitious targeting and massive coverage of program certain field level deficiencies have affected the spirit and the implementation of the scheme. Having created positive perceptions of the utility of the scheme the administration has not been able to cope with the expectations of the people. Regarding the disbursement of the subsidy 68.04% of the beneficiaries interviewed under the study have complained about undue delay in getting subsidy.

CRITICAL GAPS IN IMPLEMENTATION IDENTIFIED IN THE STUDY:

- Target emphasis on number of units rather than the number of family members covered by ISL unit has led to some aberrations. A few instances have come to notice of study team where more than one ISL is allocated in the same compound of the house with few members as occupants of the house. The basis for such selection is reported to be the possession of ration cards family units.
- Cost of ISL unit worked out in the field is between Rs: 2,500-Rs: 3,000/- The subsidy component is thus found to be inadequate in all units under the study.
- In some cases ISL have been constructed away from owned land of the beneficiary. This is likely to result in civic problems, If not checked at the time of inspection of the construction.
- ISL equipment is reported to be over priced in a few areas under demand pressure for target reaching in some cases.
- Undue delay in distribution of subsidy even for completed units.

FIELD INVESTIGATIONS AND OBSERVATIONS

- 1) All the beneficiaries are happy with the benefits of the scheme. Since this provided security for women and older members of the families. Majority of the beneficiaries feel that this will improve cleanliness of the village. Very negligible number of beneficiaries has expressed negative perceptions such as non-availability of sufficient water for maintenance of ISL.

- 2) Most of the sanctions are given as per eligibility norms. Women beneficiaries are encouraged to apply under the scheme even though they are not house owners.
- 3) This scheme has been given wide publicity by MPDOs, sarpanches and SHGs.
- 4) Even though the beneficiaries contribution is more than Rs.1000/- in all most all the ISL units and about Rs.2000/- in bath cum ISL units. Beneficiaries have come forward to utilize the scheme benefits, in view of the campaign.
- 5) The labour contribution in the construction is not on expected lines. Very few beneficiaries have contributed the labour input, while majority of the beneficiaries engaged outside labour.
- 6) It is informed that the administration has decided to treat the structure as complete even without roof, as such majority of the units fall under this category.
- 7) The ISL activity has also created local employment for masons and construction labour. Since one lakh units are taken up in entire district.
- 8) In few cases cases, even though families with less number of members with separate card are living in the same house. ISL have been granted based on the ration cards.
- 9) Even though target fixing and last date stipulation for completion of the units has helped in making officials work efficiently beneficiaries felt that under such pressure cost of contribution and price of inputs costs have gone up unreasonably.
- 10) Hardship would have been avoided for the beneficiaries, if the government has supplied inputs for the ISL at standard rates to all the beneficiaries instead of supplying rice and giving cash.
- 11) Majority of the beneficiaries have not received either the quota of rice or cash subsidy even when the units are completed in full. This type of delay has resulted in de motivation for the new beneficiaries, who have started the construction.
- 12) Even in some cases it is observed that ISLs have been constructed away from the own premises.

5. IMPACT OF THE SCHEME - TEAM FINDINGS

SALIENT IMPRESSIONS

- The scheme has addressed one of the **most important basic needs of rural poor** having a bearing on **self-dignity and social equity**.
- Thanks to the initiative and close administrative follow up of Sri Asok Kumar IAS, District Collector, this ambitious scheme has caught the imagination of poor people and **triggered a mass social empowerment of poor**, especially women who are vulnerable and placed in disadvantage position. The program has stood **as a towering model of public welfare initiative of state in the naxal infected Nizamabad district**.
- 87% of achievement of target amply demonstrates the **participative initiative of beneficiaries and team efforts of officials of district**.
- The study team found in all 16 mandals visited, **equal enthusiasm and speed in achieving the targets**.
- Given the success scores, it is interesting to watch a government program **making an impressive impact on social fabric of rural poor**.
- The fact that out of many households visited only one irregularity was found – indicates the **transparency and vigilance of administrative machinery in such a massive programme**.

➤ LONG TERM IMPACT

- **HELPS IN IMPROVING RURAL CLENLINESS**
- **IMPROVES THE GENERAL HEALTH LEVELS OF POOR LIVING IN DISADVANTAGED LOCATIONS**
- **PROVIDES SOCIAL EMPOWERMENT FOR POOR ESPECIALLY WOMEN AND AGED PEOPLE.**
- **ENHANCES SELF ESTEEM OF POOR**
- **OVER ALL IMPROVEMENT IN CIVIC CULTURE OF POOR.**

6. FINDINGS & RECOMMENDATIONS

1. FINDING :

- Majority of the beneficiaries are not happy with the distribution of the rice in lieu of cost of the project.

RECOMMENDATION :

- District administration may consider cash component in lieu of rice component. Alternatively the total construction of ISL may be taken up by the government, by collecting margin from beneficiaries.

2. FINDING :

- Inadequate subsidy availability is reported by majority of beneficiaries.

RECOMMENDATION :

- A technical review is advised in this regard to revise the unit cost.

3. FINDING :

- Majority of the beneficiaries prefer to have bath cum latrine units in view of marginal additional cost not exceeding Rs.1000/-

RECOMMENDATION :

- Subsidy component may be proportionately increased to facilitate this facility which will satisfy the basic need of the poor especially of women.

4. FINDING :

- 20% of the beneficiaries still feel that there is too much of paper work under the scheme.

RECOMMENDATION :

- Further simplification of the application forms and the documentation may be explored.

5. FINDING :

- Inputs cost is inflated under target achievement pressure in some areas.

RECOMMENDATION :

- District Administration may fix the prices and approve some suppliers for the purpose.

6. FINDING :

- Publicity on the scheme is not widespread. Some villages are covered very marginally.

RECOMMENDATION :

- Electronic media/press/school teachers may be utilized for wider publicity.

7. FINDING :

- ISLs are not put to use and utilized for different storage purposes in one or two cases.

RECOMMENDATION :

- Civic discipline needs to be enforced through community education and local administration.

8. FINDING :

- Even after implementation of scheme many households remain uncovered.

RECOMMENDATION :

- The programme should be enlarged to cover all the households. Wherever owners do not cooperate, government may collect the contribution along with revenue arrears and arrange for construction of ISLs.

9. FINDING :

- Community based organizations are not involved in propagating and implementing the scheme.

RECOMMENDATION :

- Involvement of community based organizations specially in remote villages would help in enhancing the publicity of the scheme and implementation effectively.

1. FINDING :

- Some families are not in a position to afford the stipulated margin money because of the lowest poverty level.

RECOMMENDATION :

- Such cases deserve consideration.

ABOUT nisiet

nisiet was set up in the year 1960, under the aegis of the Ministry of Small Scale Industries, Government of India, with the mandate to play a pivotal role in the promotion of SMEs by creating a pro-business environment to foster the progress of SMEs towards success and prosperity.

nisiet's raison d'être is to assist the government in formulating policies for small industries and to help practicing and potential entrepreneurs through a host of services like research, consultancy, information, training, education, and extension. **nisiet**'s training programmes are insightful and practical and bridge the gulf between theory and practice – an imperative for enduring and succeeding in today's cataclysmic business environment. Over the past four decades, **nisiet** has created an impressive record of achievements and its activities now extend beyond the Indian shores, making its presence felt in developing countries of almost all continents.

Located in a sprawling campus, amidst a rich natural setting, **nisiet** is well equipped with both physical and academic infrastructure. In keeping with the times and technological changes, the institute had upgraded its style of functioning by focusing on the use of IT in every aspect of its activities, but at the same time retaining the wisdom and advantages of deeply ingrained traditional practices.

As part of its academic activities, **nisiet** publishes a spectrum of journals, *Sedme*, a quarterly, is a well-researched journal and a forum for exchange of ideas and experiences regarding SMEs.

The management of the Institute rests with the governing council, appointed by the Government of India. The governing body acts through the Principal Director Shri **S.V.Prabhath**, an officer of the Indian Administrative Service, is currently the **Principal Director of nisiet**.

nisiet NGO network (n³), one of the special focus cells of **nisiet**, was set up in December 1999 with the prime objective of facilitating interaction among government organizations and NGOs and other stake holders in development process. The networking is designed to adopt an integral and interdisciplinary approach in developing higher professional ethics for NGOs.

n³ has also been specialising in the area of poverty elevation, focusing primarily on promotion of micro finance through self-help groups. Several training programmes for participants representing NGOs, Government departments, banks and development agencies have been conducted by **n³** in the past 3 years. **n³** also takes research studies on impact of micro finance schemes.

(An Organisation of the Ministry of Small Scale Industries, Government of India)
Yousufguda, Hyderabad 500 045